

**MINUTES
SARATOGA PLANNING COMMISSION**

DATE: Wednesday, February 8, 2006
PLACE: Council Chambers/Civic Theater, 13777 Fruitvale Avenue, Saratoga, CA
TYPE: Regular Meeting

Chair Nagpal called the meeting to order at 7:05 p.m.

ROLL CALL

Present: Commissioners Cappello, Hunter, Kundtz, Nagpal, Rodgers and Schallop
Absent: Commissioner Uhl
Staff: Director John Livingstone, Associate Planner Lata Vasudevan and Assistant Planner Suzanne Thomas

PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

APPROVAL OF MINUTES – Regular Meeting of January 11, 2006.

Motion: Upon motion of Commissioner Cappello, seconded by Commissioner Hunter, the Planning Commission minutes of the regular meeting of January 11, 2006, were adopted with corrections to pages 3 and 9. (6-0-1; Commissioner Uhl was absent)

ORAL COMMUNICATION

There were no Oral Communications.

REPORT OF POSTING AGENDA

Director John Livingstone announced that, pursuant to Government Code 54954.2, the agenda for this meeting was properly posted on February 2, 2006.

REPORT OF APPEAL RIGHTS

Chair Nagpal announced that appeals are possible for any decision made on this Agenda by filing an Appeal Application with the City Clerk within fifteen (15) calendar days of the date of the decision, pursuant to Municipal Code 15.90.050(b).

CONSENT CALENDAR

There were no Consent Calendar Items.

PUBLIC HEARING - ITEM NO. 1

APPLICATION #06-065 (517-13-032) MAGGETTI, 16233 Cuvilly Way: - The applicant requests Design Review Approval to construct a new single-family residence on a vacant lot in the Chateaux de Notres Dames Subdivision. The total floor area of the proposed residence will be 6,003 square feet including garage, with a 996 square foot basement area. The maximum height of the proposed residence will be not higher than 26 feet. The net lot size is 44,039 square-feet and the site is zoned R-1-40,000. (Lata Vasudevan)

Associate Planner Lata Vasudevan presented the staff report as follows:

- Advised that the applicant is seeking Design Review Approval to allow a new multi level single-family residence consisting of 6,003 square feet and including a 996 square foot basement. The maximum height proposed is 24 feet, 3 inches. The site is a vacant 44,039 square foot parcel in an R-1-40,000 zoning district.
- Explained that the parcel was created as a part of the Chateaux de Notres Dames Subdivision, a Sobrato subdivision.
- Said that four other Design Review applications have been approved for lots within this subdivision within the last four years. The other lots will come before the Commission for Design Review in the future.
- Described the architectural style as Mediterranean that is compatible with the other recently approved homes in this subdivision while still maintaining its own character.
- Distributed exhibits showing the homes on Lot 7 and Lot 9, which are on either side of this subject lot (Lot 8).
- Explained that there are 21 Ordinance protected trees on the property of which 9 are proposed for removal. The City Arborist has deemed these trees as suitable for removal.
- Added that the original site plan was modified as a result of the initial Arborist report in order to preserve the trees in the front yard. Mitigation measures are included within the Conditions of Approval.
- Assured that all required Design Review findings can be made in the affirmative.
- Recommended approval.

Commissioner Cappello asked about the roof material use on the adjacent residence and whether it is tile, wood or slate.

Commissioner Rodgers replied that they are depicted on the plan as being a custom blend concrete roof tile.

Chair Nagpal asked about the two sample boards distributed by staff.

Planner Lata Vasudevan advised that one demonstrates roofing and the other siding and colors.

Chair Nagpal opened the Public Hearing for Agenda Item No. 1.

Mr. Gary Kohlsaat, Project Architect:

- Said he was happy that most of the Commissioners were able to visit the site.
- Explained that this is an interesting and challenging site with several constraints to overcome to fit a house on the property, including the pie shape of the lot at the front that required the house to be set back somewhat to avoid a front elevation that was too narrow.
- Added that the large trees at the front of the property help screen the house from view.
- Said that the garage is directed at a 90-degree angle to the street. The driveway is at the north or right property line, an area that requires a reduced amount of grading.
- Advised that the driveway was modified in two locations. One is to protect the drip line of the neighbor's Walnut tree. The other was the guest parking area near the pine tree that was modified to require minimal grading.
- Pointed out that the larger front yard setback creates privacy for the adjacent neighbors.
- Stated that this home is a split-level design with the highest point being 24.5 feet, which is a tower element over the staircase that helps that elevation by providing good movement. It is not awkward but rather blends in well and serves as a focal point to this elevation.
- Said that there is a front courtyard with a four-foot wall that will incorporate a fountain and landscaping. The front will have simple landscaping and perimeter including a small lawn. The lawn is small because lawn does not grow beneath trees. The area will be largely left natural to protect these mature trees.
- Added that the back patio will be off the main living areas. There is no landscape plan for the rear yard until a buyer is found.
- Said screening between this home and the Roberson home would be added using Italian Cypress that grows to about 15 feet in height.
- Stated that the home is an Italian-style architecture using clean lines and details that offer texture including copper gutters, clay tile roof tiles, good quality windows and stucco.

Commissioner Cappello asked if the garage and game room are at the same level and if the basement is below the game room.

Mr. Gary Kohlsaat said that the family room is one foot down from the kitchen. Then it is a half-level down to the garage. The game room is one floor below the family room.

Commissioner Cappello asked if there is anything above the basement.

Mr. Gary Kohlsaat replied the family room.

Commissioner Cappello said that this is a neat layout.

Commissioner Hunter asked if any green building principles would be used for this project including solar or thermal floors.

Mr. Gary Kohlsaat replied not at this point although they would be using a high efficiency furnace. He pointed out that using the thermal floor system would actually be more expensive and require a dual system since most homes today include air conditioning in addition to heat.

Commissioner Hunter asked if solar power is beneficial in a project such as this one.

Mr. Gary Kohlsaat:

- Replied that photovoltaic is what is being pushed today.
- Cautioned that the problem with using photovoltaic systems is how to make such a system blend in aesthetically with homes like this. They still look very mechanical.
- Added that it is quite a challenge to incorporate such a system on a lot such as this one with a lot of trees that block the sun.
- Recounted that there are roof tiles available today that have photovoltaic properties but they are still very obvious in appearance.
- Assured that he likes to design in such a way as to capture as much sunlight as possible.
- Added that this house would also be very highly insulated at 2 by 6 instead of 2 by 4.
- Said that they have not discussed other green options for the interior as of yet.

Chair Nagpal closed the Public Hearing for Agenda Item No. 1.

Commissioner Cappello said that this is a beautiful design that blends into the landscaping and nearby homes. The colors and design are good.

Commissioner Hunter said that this is a lovely project and design and encouraged the retention of the Pines.

Commissioner Rodgers said that she could make the necessary findings in the affirmative as this project is well articulated, flows down hill and follows the contours of the property. Additionally there are no reflective materials. This is a great addition to the community.

Chair Nagpal expressed appreciation for the articulation in the design and the fact the home follows the grade of the property. Predicted that the breakfast nook would be the main gathering place in this home.

Motion: Upon motion of Commissioner Hunter, seconded by Commissioner Kundtz, the Planning Commission granted Design Review Approval (Application #06-065) to allow the construction of a new single-family residence, on property located at 16233 Cuvilly Way, by the following roll call vote:

AYES: Cappello, Hunter, Kundtz, Nagpal, Rodgers and Schallop
NOES: None
ABSENT: Uhl
ABSTAIN: None

PUBLIC HEARING - ITEM NO. 2

APPLICATION #06-138 (366-43-001) PARKER RANCH HOMEOWNERS ASSOCIATION, 12045 Parker Ranch Road: The applicant requests Design Review Approval to construct a

monument sign identifying a subdivision. The total area of the sign is approximately 23 square feet and the height is 4 ft. 4 inches. (Suzanne Thomas)

Assistant Planner Suzanne Thomas presented the staff report as follows:

- Described three categories of signs that are handled at an administrative level.
- Advised that the rest go to the Planning Commission including requests like this one for a freestanding monument sign identifying a subdivision.
- Explained that an existing monument sign identifying the Parker Ranch Subdivision was approved in 1992. The subdivision itself was created 25 years ago.
- Said that required findings can be made in the affirmative for this replacement sign. At 23 square feet, it complies with size regulations. The sign is compatible with the neighborhood and its placement blends with the landscaping. Brass letters are eight-inches tall on a four-foot, four-inch high sign.
- Stated that this sign would not adversely impact the area or obscure views. It is located away from the corner in the same location as the existing sign.
- Reported that the required neighbor notification was done.
- Added that two letters of support have been received and no letters of opposition.
- Recommended approval.

Commissioner Rodgers wanted record to reflect that this sign is not illuminated.

Planner Suzanne Thomas confirmed that the sign is not illuminated.

Chair Nagpal opened the Public Hearing for Agenda Item No. 2.

Mr. John Hengle, Representative of the Parker Ranch Homeowners' Association:

- Advised that he resides at 12468 Parker Ranch Court and is available for questions.
- Explained that the two applications for Parker Ranch this evening are for identical signs on separate properties within easements on those properties.

Commissioner Cappello asked who would maintain the shrubs beneath these signs.

Mr. John Hengle replied that the Homeowners' Association (HOA) would maintain the space around the sign. The remainder of the landscaping on both properties would continue to be maintained by the respective property owners.

Commissioner Cappello asked if these signs are located in common areas.

Mr. John Hengle said that they are located on individual lots for which an easement has been secured for placement of these identifying signs for this subdivision.

Chair Nagpal closed the Public Hearing for Agenda Item No. 2.

Commissioner Hunter thanked Mr. John Hengle for his presentation.

Commissioner Kundtz said that this sign puts the finishing touches on the ingress and egress ways for this subdivision. He asked about the fact that one more request is anticipated and whether that is expected to be the last sign sought for this subdivision.

Mr. John Hengle said that as far as they are concerned, that third sign would be it. However, there is no easement in place yet for the third sign. He said that they have wanted these identifying signs for years now but they had to wait for cooperative owners who would be willing to allow these necessary easements.

Motion: Upon motion of Commissioner Kundtz, seconded by Commissioner Cappello, the Planning Commission granted Design Review Approval (Application #06-138) to allow the construction of monument sign identifying a subdivision on property located at 12045 Parker Ranch Road, by the following roll call vote:

AYES: Cappello, Hunter, Kundtz, Nagpal, Rodgers and Schallop
NOES: None
ABSENT: Uhl
ABSTAIN: None

PUBLIC HEARING - ITEM NO. 3

APPLICATION #06-139 (366-49-006) PARKER RANCH HOMEOWNERS ASSOCIATION, 12467 Parker Ranch Road: The applicant requests Design Review Approval to construct a monument sign identifying a subdivision. The total area of the sign is approximately 23 square feet and the height is 4 ft. 4 inches. (Suzanne Thomas)

Assistant Planner Suzanne Thomas presented the staff report as follows:

- Stated that this is the same request as the previous except this sign is to be located on a separate parcel.
- Said that both properties are at Prospect and Parker Ranch Road.
- Advised that this only difference is that there is no existing sign on this second property.
- Informed that this request is found to be appropriate. It offers no obstruction and has no adverse impacts.
- Said that the neighbors were notified and no negative comments were received and three letters of support were received.
- Said that this sign is compatible and the required findings can be made in the affirmative.
- Recommended approval.

Chair Nagpal opened the Public Hearing for Agenda Item No. 3.

Mr. John Hengle, Representative of the Parker Ranch Homeowners' Association:

- Said he has nothing further to add unless there are questions.

Commissioner Hunter asked staff why the monument sign at Saratoga School never came before the Commission for review.

Director John Livingstone reminded that schools are exempt from City jurisdiction.

Commissioner Hunter said that it would be nice if schools did come to the City for review.

Commissioner Cappello asked if there have been any weed complaints about this site.

Mr. John Hengle replied not as far as he is aware. He pointed out that the Water District has an easement along the creek and keeps the weeds trimmed back.

Commissioner Cappello asked if the HOA would be maintaining these signs.

Mr. John Hengle replied yes, they would now. They did not have an easement for the original sign but now they do.

Chair Nagpal closed the Public Hearing for Agenda Item No. 3.

Motion: Upon motion of Commissioner Kundtz, seconded by Commissioner Rodgers, the Planning Commission granted Design Review Approval (Application #06-139) to allow the construction of monument sign identifying a subdivision on property located at 120467 Parker Ranch Road, by the following roll call vote:

AYES: Cappello, Hunter, Kundtz, Nagpal, Rodgers and Schallop
NOES: None
ABSENT: Uhl
ABSTAIN: None

DIRECTOR'S ITEMS

There were no Director's Items.

COMMISSION ITEMS

Commissioner Hunter advised that the Village Ad Hoc Committee would be visiting Pleasanton next week.

Commissioner Kundtz pointed out that the neighborhood notification template form has two lines. One states that the undersigned certifies that they are okay with the proposal. The other states that they are not okay. He said that it is important to add a box for the person signing the document to check off which of these two statements applies to their signature below.

Chair Nagpal suggested another preparatory meeting before the next Planning Commission meeting on February 22nd to complete discussions for the joint session with Council.

Commissioner Cappello suggested not starting before 6 p.m.

Chair Nagpal asked about Form 700 and whether any of the other Commissioners had received a form to complete as of yet this year.

Commissioner Hunter said that this form is usually due by April.

COMMUNICATIONS

There were no Communications Items.

ADJOURNMENT TO NEXT MEETING

Upon motion of Commissioner Hunter, seconded by Commissioner Cappello, Chair Nagpal adjourned the meeting at 7:50 p.m. to the next Regular Planning Commission meeting of **February 22, 2006**, at 7:00 p.m.

MINUTES PREPARED AND SUBMITTED BY:
Corinne A. Shinn, Minutes Clerk