

APPENDIX C

Arborist Report for Palm Villas Saratoga Project



Community Development Department
City of Saratoga
13777 Fruitvale Avenue
Saratoga, California 95070

ARBORIST REPORT

Prepared by Kate Bear, City Arborist
Phone: (408) 868-1276
Email: kbear@saratoga.ca.us

Application No. **ARB15-0053**
Site: **Palm Villas – Saratoga Creek Drive**
Owner: Golden Age Properties
APN: 389-06-020
and 389-06-021
Email: michaelsneper@gmail.com

Report History: Final report - corrected

Date: December 4, 2017

PROJECT SCOPE:

The applicant has submitted plans to build a new assisted care facility with two buildings, one on each parcel. Each building will be two stories and have underground parking.

Three coast live oaks (trees **11, 12, 13, 15** and **16**) are requested for removal to construct the project.

STATUS: Approved by City Arborist, with attached conditions.

PROJECT DATA IN BRIEF:

Tree bond –	Required - \$96,000
Tree fencing –	Required – See Conditions of Approval and attached map.
Tree removals –	Trees 11, 12, 13, 15 and 16 are approved for removal and replacement once building permits have been issued.
Replacement trees –	Required = \$11,700

ATTACHMENTS:

- 1 – Findings
- 2 – Tree Removal Criteria
- 3 – Conditions of Approval
- 4 – Map Showing Tree Protection

FINDINGS:Tree Removals

According to Section 15-50.080 of the City Code, whenever a tree is requested for removal as part of a project, certain findings must be made and specific tree removal criteria met. Three coast live oaks (trees **11**, **12** and **13**) and two Brazilian peppers (trees **15** and **16**) are requested for removal to construct the project. All of these trees meet the City's criteria allowing them to be removed and replaced as part of the project, once building division permits have been obtained. Attachment 2 contains the tree removal criteria for reference.

Table 1: Summary of Tree Removal Criteria that are met

Tree No.	Species	Criteria met
11, 12, 13	Coast live oak	1, 7, 9
15, 16	Brazilian pepper	1, 7, 9

New Construction

Based on the information provided, and as conditioned, this project complies with the requirements for the setback of new construction from existing trees under Section 15-50.120 of the City Code.

Tree Preservation Plan

Section 15-50.140 of the City Code requires a Tree Preservation Plan for this project. To satisfy this requirement the following shall be copied onto a plan sheet and included in the final sets of plans:

- 1) The submitted arborist report dated January 29, 2016; and
- 2) This report dated March 31, 2017.

TREE INFORMATION:Arborist reports reviewed:

Preparer: Deborah Ellis, Consulting Arborist and Horticulturist

Dates of Reports: July 27, 2015, January 29, 2016, November 14, 2016

Arborist reports were submitted for this project that inventoried 16 trees protected by Saratoga City Code. Information on the condition of each tree, potential impacts from construction, suitability for preservation, appraised values and tree protection recommendations was provided. Three coast live oaks (trees 11, 12 and 13) and two Brazilian peppers (trees 15 and 16) protected by Saratoga City Code are requested for removal to construct this project. A table summarizing information about each tree is below.

Table 2: List of trees and appraised values



Deborah Ellis, MS

Consulting Arborist & Horticulturist

TABLE 1 SUMMARY TREE TABLE

Tree #	Common Name	Trunk Diam. (DBH)	Preservation Suitability	Estimated Value	Expected Construction Impact	Action	Reason
1	coast live oak	20 (2.5)	Good	\$7,200	Moderate	Save	
2	blue elderberry	9,10,8,4,4	Poor/Unacceptable	480	Uncertain	Debatable	Construction. Overall Condition, Actual location
3	coast live oak	10,12	Fair/Good	3,850	Low	Save but remove trunk overhanging site	Risk
4	coast live oak	12,18,29,30	Good	42,200	Low/Moderate	Save	
5	elderberry	7,8,12	Fair/Poor	1,760	Low/Moderate	Save	
6	elderberry	12	Fair/Poor	900	Low	Save	
7	elderberry	13,10	Fair/Poor	1840	Low	Save	
8	coast live oak	7	Good	1,400	Low	Save	
9	Calif. sycamore	25,18,19,8	Good	24,800	Moderate/ Severe	Debatable	Construction
*10	London plane	18	Fair	5,900	Moderate	Save	
11	coast live oak	6,7	Fair/Good	1,350	Severe	Remove	Construction
12	coast live oak	8	Fair/Good	1,350	Severe	Remove	Construction
13	coast live oak	8	Fair/Good	1,350	Severe	Remove	Construction
14	coast live oak	10,8,7,6	Fair/Good	5,700	Low/Moderate	Save	
Total Estimated Value				\$100,080			

*Species not native to the immediate area. All other species are native to the immediate area and are probably of natural growth, meaning that they were not planted.

PO Box 3714, Saratoga, CA 95070. 408-725-1357. decah@pacbell.net. http://www.decah.com.

Deborah Ellis, MS

Consulting Arborist & Horticulturist



TABLE 1 SUMMARY TREE TABLE

Tree #	Common Name	Trunk Diam. (DBH)	Preservation Suitability	Estimated Value	Expected Construction Impact	Action	Reason
15	Brazilian pepper	6, 6, 5, 4	Poor	\$4,250	Severe	Remove	Construction
16	Brazilian pepper	5, 5, 4, 4	Poor	\$3,400	Severe	Remove	Construction

From arborist report #1 for Palm Villas, July 27, 2015 by Deborah Ellis.

TREE REMOVAL CRITERIA

Criteria that permit the removal of a protected tree are listed below. This information is from Article 15-50.080 of the City Code and is applied to any tree requested for removal as part of the project. If findings are made that meet the criteria listed below, the tree(s) may be approved for removal and replacement during construction.

- (1) The condition of the tree with respect to disease, imminent danger of falling, proximity to existing or proposed structures and interference with utility services, and whether the tree is a Dead tree or a Fallen tree.
- (2) The necessity to remove the tree because of physical damage or threatened damage to improvements or impervious surfaces on the property.
- (3) The topography of the land and the effect of the tree removal upon erosion, soil retention and the diversion or increased flow of surface waters, particularly on steep slopes.
- (4) The number, species, size and location of existing trees in the area and the effect the removal would have upon shade, privacy impact, scenic beauty, property values, erosion control, and the general welfare of residents in the area.
- (5) The age and number of healthy trees the property is able to support according to good forestry practices.
- (6) Whether or not there are any alternatives that would allow for retaining or not encroaching on the protected tree.
- (7) Whether the approval of the request would be contrary to or in conflict with the general purpose and intent of this Article.
- (8) Any other information relevant to the public health, safety, or general welfare and the purposes of this ordinance as set forth in [Section 15-50.010](#)
- (9) The necessity to remove the tree for economic or other enjoyment of the property when there is no other feasible alternative to the removal.
- (10) The necessity to remove the tree for installation and efficient operation of solar panels, subject to the requirements that the tree(s) to be removed, shall not be removed until solar panels have been installed and replacement trees planted in conformance with the City Arborist's recommendation.

CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL

1. It is the responsibility of the owner, architect and contractor to be familiar with the information in this report and implement the required conditions.
2. All recommendations in the arborist report dated January 27, 2016 prepared by Deborah Ellis shall become conditions of approval.
3. The arborist report dated January 27, 2016 shall be copied on to a plan sheet, titled “Tree Preservation” and included in the final job copy set of plans.
4. This report dated March 31 shall be copied onto a plan sheet and included in the final plans.
5. The designated Project Arborist shall be Ian Geddes, unless otherwise approved by the City Arborist.
6. Tree Protection Security Deposit
 - a. Is required per City Ordinance 15-50.080.
 - b. Shall **\$96,000** be for tree(s) **1 – 10 and 14**.
 - c. Shall be obtained by the owner and filed with the Community Development Department before obtaining Building Division permits.
 - d. May be in the form of cash, check, credit card payment or a bond.
 - e. Shall remain in place for the duration of construction of the project.
 - f. May be released once the project has been completed, inspected and approved by the City Arborist.
7. Tree Protection Fencing:
 - a. Shall be installed as shown on the attached map.
 - b. Shall be shown on the Site Plan.
 - c. Shall be established prior to the arrival of construction equipment or materials on site.
 - d. Shall be comprised of six-foot high chain link fencing mounted on eight-foot tall, 2-inch diameter galvanized posts, driven 24 inches into the ground and spaced no more than 10 feet apart.
 - e. Shall be posted with signs saying “TREE PROTECTION FENCE - DO NOT MOVE OR REMOVE WITHOUT APPROVAL FROM CITY ARBORIST, KATE BEAR (408) 868-1276”.
 - f. Call City Arborist, Kate Bear at (408) 868-1276 for an inspection of tree protection fencing once it has been installed. This is required prior to obtaining building division permits.
 - g. Tree protection fencing shall remain undisturbed throughout the construction until final inspection.
 - h. If contractor feels that work must be done inside the fenced area, call City Arborist to arrange a field meeting before performing work.
8. The Project Arborist shall visit the site every two weeks during excavation, trenching and grading activities and monthly thereafter. Following visits to the site, the Project Arborist shall provide the City with a report including photos documenting the progress of the project and noting any tree issues.

9. The Project Arborist shall be on site to monitor all work within:
 - a. **8** feet of tree **1**
 - b. **20** feet of tree **9**
10. **The Project Arborist shall supervise all work under the canopy of tree 9.** This includes excavation for the basement parking, construction of the stairs to the basement, installation of drainage by the tree, installation of the walkway behind the building, and any necessary pruning of the canopy.
11. The Mitigation and Monitoring Plan for this project shall include measures that minimize the environmental impacts to sycamore tree 9 during construction.
12. Following completion of the work around trees, and before a final inspection of the project, the applicant shall provide a letter to the City from the Project Arborist. That letter shall document the work performed around trees, include photos of the work in progress, and provide information on the condition of the trees.
13. No protected tree authorized for removal or encroachment pursuant to this project may be removed or encroached upon until the issuance of the applicable permit from the building division for the approved project.
14. Receipt of a Planning or Building permit does not relieve applicant of his responsibilities for protecting trees per City Code Article 15-50 on all construction work.
15. All construction activities shall be conducted outside tree protection fencing. These activities include, but are not necessarily limited to, the following: demolition, grading, trenching, equipment cleaning, stockpiling and dumping materials (including soil fill), and equipment/vehicle operation and parking.
16. Trenching to install utilities is not permitted inside tree protection fencing.
17. Roots of protected trees measuring two inches in diameter or more shall not be cut without prior approval of the Project Arborist. Roots measuring less than two inches in diameter may be cut using a sharp pruning tool.
18. Any permitted pruning or root pruning of trees on site shall be performed under the supervision of the Project Arborist and according to ISA standards.
19. Trees **11, 12 13, 15** and **16** meet the criteria for removal and may be removed and replaced once Building Division permits have been obtained.
20. Trees permitted for removal shall be replaced on or off site according to good forestry practices, and shall provide equivalent value in terms of aesthetic and environmental quality, size, height, location, appearance and other significant beneficial characteristics of the removed trees. The value of the removed trees shall be calculated in accordance with the ISA Guide for Plant Appraisal.

21. New trees equal to **\$11,700** shall be planted as part of the project before final inspection and occupancy of the new home. New trees may be of any species. Replacement values for new trees are listed below.
15 gallon = \$350 24 inch box = \$500 36 inch box = \$1,500
48 inch box = \$5,000 60 inch box = 7,000 72 inch box = \$15,000
22. Replacement trees may be planted anywhere on the property as long as they do not encroach on retained trees.
23. Should any tree be damaged beyond repair, new trees shall be required to replace the tree. If there is insufficient room to plant new trees, some or all of the replacement value for trees shall be paid into the City's Tree Fund.
24. At the end of the project, when the contractor wants to remove tree protection fencing and have the tree protection security deposit released by the City, call City Arborist for a final inspection.

